

**BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF PILOTS OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK**  
**Minutes of the Meeting of 22 March 2022**

The following Commissioners were present:

James Mercante, President  
Lucienne Bulow  
Richard Hendrick  
Joseph Ahlstrom  
William Rowland  
Jeffrey Loechner

**UPON MOTION DULY MADE, SECONDED AND UNANIMOUSLY VOTED UPON, (EXCEPT AS OTHERWISE MINUTED) IN A PUBLIC MEETING, WHICH CONVENED AT 10:30 A.M., THE BOARD CONDUCTED THE FOLLOWING BUSINESS:**

1. The President called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.
2. Appearances in Public Session: None.
3. The Draft Minutes of the 15 March 2022 meeting were reviewed, amended, and approved.
4. Adjournment to Executive Session for personnel, legal advice of counsel, medical, and/or official investigative matters, as necessary:
  - Pilot sick leave/other leave.
  - Apprentice ship rides – reported discrepancies by the SHPA.
5. Return to Public Session from Executive Session. No action taken.
6. Renewed, for a period of one year (unless otherwise noted), the following New York State pilot license(s) following a personal interview and review of work performance data, training, and medical/health records:
  - Wyatt Smith (FBSHP)
7. Other Pilot/Personnel Matters: Continued on the docket.
8. Sandy Hook Pilots Association:
  - 8a. 2022 Apprentice Selection Committee: At the 15 February 2022 meeting, the Board appointed Executive Director Garger as Board representative. Continued on the docket.
  - 8b. Pilotage rate legislation: At the 15 February 2022 meeting, the Board reviewed the legislation introduced in the New York State Legislature. At today's meeting, the Board continued to discuss the legislation. Continued on the docket.
  - 8c. The Board noted that the blessing of the new Pilot Boat NEW YORK will take place on 23 March 2022 at the SHPA Staten Island base.
  - 8d. The Board reviewed the Monthly Apprentice Report dated 9 March 2022.
  - 8e. At the 27 October 2020 meeting, the SHPA advised the Board that it would be commencing a shipboard pilot ladder training program for apprentices and pilots at a climbing facility in Northvale, New Jersey. The first group of apprentices attended a training session on 28 January 2021. Executive Director Garger attended this session and provided a report to the Board. The Board has continued to be updated on the training sessions by the SHPA and has also reviewed comments that have been submitted by apprentices regarding the training sessions. The minutes of the 15 March 2022 meeting on this issue are incorporated herein by reference. Continued on the docket.
  - 8f. At the 28 January 2020 meeting, the Board discussed and reviewed the SHPA procedures for communicating Pilot Boarding Deficiency Reports to its pilots. At the 24 March 2020 meeting, the Board

approved a letter to the SHPA, LIS/BIS Pilots, and the HRPA regarding distribution of the Reports to pilots. At the 7 April 2020 meeting, the Board reviewed a response to its letter from the SHPA. At the 19 May 2020 meeting, the Board was advised that the Executive Director of the LIS/BIS Pilots sent a request to all LIS/BIS pilots to utilize Pilot Boarding Deficiency Reports to track and resolve any deficiencies that are found. Similarly, at the 23 June 2020 meeting, Hudson River Pilot Association President Ian Corcoran advised the Board that all Hudson River Pilots have been provided with Pilot Boarding Deficiency Report forms for use when a deficiency is found. The Board has continued to review additional Pilot Boarding Deficiency Reports as received from the New York State pilot associations (See 9, Pilot Boarding Deficiency Reports, below). The minutes of the 26 October 2021 minutes on this issue are incorporated herein by reference. Continued on the docket.

8g. State Licensed Pilot Security Training and Communications/FEMA Port Security Grants: At the 10 December 2019 meeting, the Board granted a Training and Education expenditure to the SHPA to defray the cost for development of a pilot security training and communications course with the assistance of the Maritime Institute of Technology and Graduate Studies (MITAGS). Pilots began attending training sessions on 10 February 2020. The Board was subsequently informed that the training sessions were suspended due to the COVID-19 emergency.

On 1 July 2020, the Board was advised that its 2020 Port Security Grant (PSG) application to provide state licensed pilots with advanced security training was approved. At the 6 October 2020 meeting and subsequent meetings, the Board reviewed the current MITAGS security training curriculum and discussed additional steps in the reimplementation of the security training program. At the 20 July 2021 meeting, the Board was informed that its 2021 Grant application to provide CCTV cameras for the Sandy Hook Pilot Association's new pilot vessel NEW YORK was approved. At the 2 November 2021 meeting, the Board reviewed the invoice from GMT Electronics for the installation of the CCTV cameras on the P/B NEW YORK. At the 1 March 2022 meeting, the Board was advised that training sessions would recommence at MITAGS in September 2022. The Minutes of the 30 June 2020 and 28 September 2021 meeting on these issues are incorporated herein by reference. Continued on the docket.

9. Hudson River Pilots Association:

9a. Following the formation of the Hudson River Safety and Navigation Operations Committee (HR Committee) to address issues raised in the Port and Waterways Safety Assessment study of the Hudson River, the Board has been regularly briefed on the HR Committees activities, including its review of legislation regarding the establishment of anchorages on the Hudson River. At the 12 January 2021 meeting, the Board was advised that the United States Coast Guard Authorization Act of 2020 was passed by Congress and contained provisions that address the establishment of anchorages on the Hudson River and circumstances when vessels can be anchored outside established anchorage grounds. At the 19 October 2021 and 2 November 2021 meetings, Commissioner Hendrick provided an update regarding the activities of the HR Committee. Continued on the docket.

9b. The Board was advised that Pilot-in-Training Kevin Mullins would begin the state pilot exam today.

9c. **The Board discussed the scheduled arrival on 2 April 2022 of the M/V KIJKGRACHT at the Port of Albany. ??**

10. Long Island Sound/Block Island Sound Pilotage:

10a. Pilotage Requirements: The Board has reviewed and responded to several inquiries regarding New York State pilotage requirements for survey vessels operating in Long Island Sound and Block Island Sound. The most recent inquiry was by survey vessel operator MMT Sweden regarding the GO ELECTRA, which the Board responded to in a letter dated 9 September 2021. At the 15 February 2022 meeting and subsequent meetings, the Board has continued to review a request by the Northeast Marine Pilots Association to review pilotage requirements for a heavy lift vessel operated by DEME Offshore. The minutes of the 25 January 2022 Board Meeting are incorporated herein by reference. Continued on the docket.

11. FIRST QUARTER 2022 PILOT BOARDING DEFICIENCY REPORTS AS PROVIDED TO THE BOARD (PRIOR REPORTS ON FILE):

M/V MARITIME TRANQUILITY (Singapore Registered Tanker, Built 2020) 19 January 2022: New York SHP Matthew Haley reported improper manning of pilot boarding area (no licensed deck officer).

M/V ZHONG GU JI LIN (Chinese Registered Container Ship, Built 2002) 10 February 2022: New Jersey SHP M.C. Chambers reported non-compliant "trap door" arrangement.

M/V MSC CORNELIA (Liberian Registered Container Ship, Built 2010) 19 February 2022: New York SHP Matthew Haley reported improper rigging of the pilot ladder.

M/V WAN HAI 612 (Singaporean Registered Container Ship, Built 2001) 5 March 2022: New Jersey SHP Paul Klein reported improperly rigged "trap door" arrangement.

12. REPORT(S) OF MARINE ACCIDENTS/INCIDENTS UNDER INVESTIGATION:

12a. SSI MARVELOUS (Marshall Islands Registered Bulk Carrier, Built 2013): 17 October 2021. FBHRP Paul Chevalier boarded the SSI MARVELOUS, a light scrap ship with a draft of 25 feet 3 inches, at the Port of Albany for an outbound passage with an original scheduled departure time at 1400 on 16 October 2021. Due to the presence of a tug and dredge barge tied up in the turning basin, Captain Chevalier refused to pilot the ship from the berth, necessitating the rescheduling of the vessel's departure to 0700 on 17 October 2021. The reason for the refusal to pilot was investigated. At the 18 January 2022 meeting, Captain Chevalier appeared before the Board. At the 8 February 2022 meeting, the Board noted the letter issued to the HRP A directing the HRP A to develop communication protocols when there are issues that could result in a delayed sailing. At the 1 March 2022 meeting, the Board discussed HRP A President Captain Ian Corcoran's response to its letter. At the 15 March 2022 meeting, the Board discussed the protocols with HRP A President Captain Ian Corcoran. **Add anything???** Continued on the docket.

12b. M/V EAGLE TURIN (Singapore Registered Tanker, Built 2008): 5 August 2020. This incident involves the tragic fatality of FBSHP Timothy Murray resulting from a fall off a pilot ladder and onto the Pilot Launch AMERICA while boarding the M/V EAGLE TURIN at approximately 2230 upon its arrival at Ambrose Pilot Station. The P/L AMERICA then immediately proceeded back to the Pilot Boat NEW JERSEY (a three-minute transit) to pick up medical supplies, a stokes litter, and crew with paramedic training before departing for Staten Island. The U.S. Coast Guard, New York City Fire Department, and New York City Police Department were all notified. Crew personnel administered CPR and used the AED unit while proceeding to Staten Island. New York City Police Department Personnel were waiting at the Sandy Hook Pilot Base where Captain Murray was transferred to an ambulance and taken to Staten Island University Hospital.

After the incident, the EAGLE TURIN proceeded to anchor at the direction of the U.S. Coast Guard. On the morning of 6 August 2020, FBSHP Kevin Walsh piloted the vessel to Stapleton Anchorage where a further investigation ensued with the U.S. Coast Guard, SHPA, and Executive Director Garger. The Board has been designated as a Party in Interest by the U.S. Coast Guard. As part of the Board's ongoing investigation, Commissioner Ahlstrom and Executive Director Garger interviewed Captain Kevin Walsh on 17 February 2021 regarding his pilotage of the EAGLE TURIN on 6 August 2020. At the 7 December 2021 meeting, the Board discussed the meeting with the Coast Guard on 3 December 2021, attended by Commissioners Ahlstrom and Rowland and Executive Director Garger, to review the Coast Guard's factual findings. Continued on the docket.

12c. M/V MAERSK KENSINGTON (United States Registered Containership, Built 2007): 30 December 2019. Fatality. FBSHP Dennis Sherwood sustained fatal injuries after falling from the ship's pilot ladder onto the Pilot Launch PHANTOM while attempting to board the ship at approximately 0430 at the Ambrose pilot station. The USCG was notified. At 0630, FBSHP Edward Ireland boarded the M/V MAERSK KENSINGTON and brought it to its berth in Port Elizabeth. After the vessel docked, the Board dispatched Commissioner Ahlstrom to the vessel to attend the U.S. Coast Guard casualty investigation and interviews of the ship's crew.

On 3 January 2020, the Board was designated as a Party in Interest by the U.S. Coast Guard and continued to participate in the investigation. On 14 January 2020, a Board representative attended Coast Guard interviews of the crew of the Pilot Launch PHANTOM that transported Captain Sherwood to the MAERSK KENSINGTON. Executive Director Garger attended the U.S. Coast Guard inspection of the MAERSK KENSINGTON on 17 January 2020 while the vessel was docked in Port Elizabeth. At the 28 July 2020 meeting, the Board received a report on the review of the MAERSK KENSINGTON Voyage Data Recorder at U.S. Coast Guard Sector New York. The Board issued its Findings, Opinions, and Recommendations on 11 September 2020. The Board issued an Addendum to its Report on 13 November 2020, which included the American Pilot Association's February 12, 2020 letter to State Pilotage Authorities regarding pilot safety and the U.S. Coast Guard's Marine Information Safety Bulletin dated 5 November 2020 addressing trapdoor pilot ladder configurations. At today's meeting, the Board continued to discuss the document subpoena received on 17 February 2021 from SHPA's counsel. The minutes of the 13 April 2021 meeting on this marine accident are incorporated herein by reference. Continued on the docket.

### 13. NEW YORK PILOTAGE WATER ISSUES:

13a. The Board has previously reviewed cruise ship pier allisions in the Port of New York/New Jersey and elsewhere. The Board has also reviewed 46 U.S.C. Section 8501 regarding the coordination of federal and state law requirements with respect to pilotage of cruise ships when the master docks the vessel and has noted incidents in Alaska where cruise ships were docked by the ship's master with a compulsory state pilot aboard. In light of the foregoing, the Board recommended that the SHPA work with cruise lines calling at the Port of New York to develop a joint training program that would improve communications between state licensed pilots and cruise ship masters. At the 30 March 2021 meeting, the Board discussed the status of the return of cruise ships to New York/New Jersey with SHP Thomas Walsh. At the 6 April 2021 meeting, the Board discussed the Manhattan Cruise Terminal operation. At the 17 August 2021 meeting, the Board was advised that the OASIS OF THE SEAS would be arriving in the Port of NY/NJ on 18 August 2021, which was the first passenger ship to arrive since sailing was halted due to the COVID pandemic. Continued on the docket.

13b. The Board has previously advised the Army Corps of Engineers New York District (ACOE) of its concerns with the lack of visibility of large, unlit mooring buoys, especially during periods of darkness, located within certain designated federal anchorages in New York Harbor. At the 12 January 2021 meeting, the Board was advised that the mooring buoy issue was not addressed in the ACOE Anchorage Study of New York and New Jersey Anchorages. Continued on the docket.

14. Pilotage of Foreign Flag Yachts/Recreational Vessels: Legislation enacted in 2020 amended the New York Navigation Law by exempting recreational vessels of less than 200 feet overall in length from compulsory state pilotage at the Board's discretion. At the 1 June 2021 meeting, the Board discussed the requirements relative to yachts entering LIS/BIS waters. Continued on the docket.

15. In view of several ship pilot ladder boarding accidents involving both New York and New Jersey State Pilots in the Port of New York, the Board of Commissioners formed a special Pilot Transfer Subcommittee. The Subcommittee consists of the Board President (Mercante), Executive Director (Garger), and members of the Board (Ahlstrom and Rowland). The Subcommittee is reviewing and evaluating safety protocols, equipment, and ship boarding arrangements currently used by the state pilots while boarding ships at sea or elsewhere by pilot ladder. At the 22 February 2022 meeting, the Board reviewed the revised International Chamber of Shipping Industry Guidance on Pilot Transfer Arrangements. The minutes of the 21 December 2021 Board Meeting are incorporated herein by reference. Continued on the docket.

15a. In August 2020, the New Jersey Maritime Pilot and Docking Commission formed a Pilot Safety Committee to evaluate pilot transfer arrangements, PPE gear, and pilot fitness. The New York Board participated on that Committee. At the 10 November 2020 meeting, the Board discussed a draft report on pilot safety issued by the New Jersey Committee. The New Jersey Committee issued its report on 6 November 2020. Continued on the docket.

16. At the 15 February 2022 meeting, the Board noted the proposed legislation regarding New York State Commissions. Continued on the docket.

17.

18.

19. At the 15 February 2022 meeting, the Board discussed notification received from 17 Battery Place regarding a possible office relocation. Continued on the docket.

20.

21. Legislation was reintroduced in the New York State legislature during the 2021-2022 legislative session addressing penalties for the operation of boats and vessels while under the influence of alcohol or drugs. At the 6 July 2021 meeting, the Board was advised that the legislation had passed in the State Senate. Continued on the docket.

22. The Board discussed attendance at the APA Convention 16-22 October 2022.

23. In August 2021, the Board published a booklet containing a report originally drafted by retired Executive Director Robert Pouch concerning his personal experiences following the 9-11 terrorist attack on the World Trade Center. The booklet was widely disseminated to the maritime community as a tribute to those that lost their lives and those that provided aid and assistance during the response and recovery efforts.

24. There being no further business to conduct, or public comment, the Board meeting was adjourned at 11:30 a.m.



Andrew Garger  
Secretary